

Report by the Senate Budget Policies Committee on Whether the University's Guidelines for the Review of Academic Planning Proposals (1995) and the Planning and Budget System Have Been Followed in the Case of the Dietrich School of Arts and Sciences' Proposals to Suspend the Graduate Programs in Classics and German Indefinitely and Terminate the Graduate Program in Religious Studies

October 18, 2013

The Planning and Budget System (PBS) document charges the Senate Budget Policies Committee (SBPC) with the responsibility of reviewing whether PBS processes are followed, and whether all constituencies involved are provided adequate opportunities to participate in the process and to be informed of its outcomes. The Senate Budget Policies Committee has exercised this responsibility in the case of the Dietrich School of Arts and Sciences proposals to suspend the graduate programs in Classics and German and terminate the graduate program in Religious Studies. This report documents the SBPC's findings.

On April 5, 2012, a decision was made by the Deans of the Dietrich School of Arts and Sciences to suspend admissions to the graduate programs in Classics, German, and Religious Studies. This decision was made without prior consultation with the chairs of the affected departments, and without discussion or approval of the suspension of these three specific programs by the Dietrich School's relevant shared governance committees. While the lack of prior consultation was counter to the spirit of the Planning and Budget System, the appropriate bodies were subsequently consulted (see below), and the initial action was not a violation of the University's *Guidelines for the Review of Academic Planning Proposals* (1995) because a temporary suspension of admissions is not the same as termination or substantial modification of a program.

The Dietrich School Deans held meetings later in April and in May, 2012, with the School's Graduate Council and with its Planning and Budget Committee; the decision to suspend admissions was reviewed, and there was a general expression of support for the criteria and data that were used to argue for suspension of these graduate programs. Throughout April and into May, there were meetings with the departmental Chairs and Directors of Graduate Studies, with the Council of Humanities Chairs, and with other faculty to explain the rationale for the suspension of admission, to review and amend relevant data, and to discuss a range of possible futures for these programs. The Chairs of the affected departments were invited in writing on May 15, 2012 to submit responses and/or alternative proposals by October 1, 2012. The deadline was extended for the Classics and Religious Studies Departments. The German and Classics Departments submitted formal written responses; Religious Studies did not, though there were informal conversations with the Chair.

Draft proposals for the indefinite suspension of the graduate programs in Classics and German, and termination of the graduate program in Religious Studies, were reviewed by the Dietrich School Graduate Council on April 12, 2013. The Graduate Council made suggestions to clarify wording in the draft proposals and voted to send the proposals forward to the Dietrich School Council as part of the report of the Associate Dean. The revised proposals were sent to the department Chairs for comment on April 16, 2013; formal responses were received from the Classics and German Departments, but not Religious Studies, as of May 10. The Dietrich School Council reviewed the revised draft proposals on May 2, 2013, and agreed to postpone a vote on

the proposals for a week to give members time to read the chairs' responses. The Dietrich School Council met again on May 10, 2013, and voted to accept these proposals as part of the report of the Associate Dean for Graduate Studies. The Dietrich School's Planning and Budget Committee reviewed and approved these proposals by a vote of 12 to 1. This review process met the School's Bylaw requirements, and the proposals themselves met the requirements of Section 1B., Proposals for Termination of Majors, Degree Programs, Academic Departments or Schools, in the *Guidelines for the Review of Academic Planning Proposals* (1995).

On June 4, 2013, Dietrich School of Arts and Sciences Dean John Cooper submitted to Provost Patricia Beeson proposals to suspend the graduate programs in Classics and German indefinitely, and to terminate the graduate program in Religious Studies. On Tuesday Sept. 17, 2013 the University Council on Graduate Studies (UCGS) held an open meeting from 3-6 pm in Ballroom A of the University Club to discuss the Dietrich School's proposals to suspend the graduate programs in Classics and German indefinitely and to terminate the graduate program in Religious Studies. The meeting date, time and agenda were listed on the UCGS website. The meeting site was subsequently moved from 817 CL to the University Club in response to faculty requests that the meeting be held in a larger room.

The Sept. 17 UCGS meeting was well attended by members of the graduate faculty (about 50) who were not members of the UCGS committee. Copies of the Dietrich School's proposals to suspend/terminate the graduate programs in Classics, German, and Religious Studies (which were marked confidential on the cover letter), written responses from the chairs of the affected departments, and written comments from faculty and students opposing the suspensions or termination were set out on chairs provided for graduate faculty attending the UCGS meeting. From 3-5 pm, Dietrich School Deans John Cooper and Kathleen Blee presented the proposals to suspend or terminate the graduate programs in Classics, German, and Religious Studies; the three department chairs were allowed to present their comments; and UCGS members were given the opportunity to ask questions. From 5-6 pm members of the graduate faculty were allowed to comment on the proposed suspensions and termination, with a 5 minute limit per person.

The SBPC finds no procedural fault with the process utilized by UCGS in reviewing the proposed suspensions/termination of the graduate programs in Classics, German, and Religious Studies through the Sept. 17, 2013, UCGS meeting.

In conclusion, the SBPC believes that subsequent to the decision by the Deans of the Dietrich School of Arts and Sciences to suspend admissions to the graduate programs in Classics, German, and Religious Studies, the processes used by the Dietrich School Deans in preparing proposals to suspend the graduate programs in Classics and German indefinitely, and to terminate the graduate program in Religious Studies, met the procedural requirements of the Dietrich School's Bylaws and the University's *Guidelines for Review of Academic Planning Proposals*. The review carried out by the Provost's Office and UCGS adhered to acceptable shared governance standards and the Planning and Budgeting System. In reaching these conclusions, the SBPC has only considered procedural requirements, not the merit of the proposals.